PART A: INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

This document, prepared by Anokiiwin Employment Solutions for the Aboriginal Justice Implementation Committee, sets forth a final discussion paper outlining practical steps in an effort to increase Aboriginal employment representation within the Manitoba Department of Justice and other applicable governmental departments and/or agencies.

The issue of Aboriginal employment representation in Manitoba represents a unique and complex set of challenges and opportunities for both provincial and Aboriginal policy makers. With a rapidly growing Aboriginal population, relatively high Aboriginal unemployment rates, and an increasing Aboriginal participation rate in the provincial labour force, considerable action is required by all stakeholders in order to improve Aboriginal employment prospects and outcomes throughout all provincial employment sectors and occupational levels.¹

The Manitoba government civil service, representing the provinces largest single employer, represents a significant area where an improvement in Aboriginal employment prospects and outcomes is deemed imperative.² Currently, despite comprising approximately 12% of the provincial population, Aboriginal people represent just 7.3% of all provincial government employees.³ Subtracting all seasonal and part-time employees from the Department of Natural Resources ("Conservation"), this figure quickly decreases to 6%.

The issue of Aboriginal employment under-representation within the provincial government was identified as one of the significant issues detailing the failure of the Manitoba justice system in the AJI report. It represents one of the key mandated priorities of the recently established Aboriginal Justice Implementation Committee.

While underrepresented in employment levels, Aboriginal people in Manitoba represent a significantly high proportion of inmates/offenders within the province (roughly 60 to 90% depending on the particular institution). According to the AJI, over-representation occurs at "virtually every step of the judicial process". Moreover, "Aboriginal over-representation is the end point of a series of decisions made by those with decision-making power in the justice system. An examination of each of these decisions suggests that the way that decisions are made within the justice system discriminates against Aboriginal people at virtually every point."

As a significant but partial remedy, the AJI recommended increases in the level of Aboriginal representation within the Department.

¹ A 1998 report by the Conference Board of Canada entitled "Employment Prospects for Aboriginal People" indicates that by the year 2006, Manitoba's Aboriginal population will comprise 20% of the provincial labour force. Some other sources indicate that this number will be closer to 25%.

² The Department represents the largest single employer within the Manitoba civil service, representing approximately 2,660 employees out of an estimated total of 14, 622 (18.19%).

³ 1996 Statistics Canada reported that Aboriginal people consisted of 11.7% of the provincial population. As of March 31, 2000, the total number of employees in Manitoba Civil Service Commission was 14, 622 with approximately 1,067 Aboriginal employees.

Examining the issue of employment equity

All Canadian jurisdictions have human rights or similar legislation that allows for the voluntary implementation of employment equity. Manitoba, like most governments in Canada, has an employment equity policy and/or programs. The federal government is the lone jurisdiction that has employment equity legislation. All these initiatives are concerned with removing or reducing barriers to produce a more balanced representation of qualified individuals in the workplace.

Generally, employment equity initiatives strive for employment representation levels consistent with representative population statistics. Employment equity is built on the rationale that workplaces should represent the general make-up of society. For government employers, this rationale is essential given that all "constituent" groups need to feel included within the institutional framework that governs them.

Across the many jurisdictions, employment equity initiatives are viewed as a work in progress. Many employers continue to face challenges in achieving a genuinely representative workforce with successes attributed to those employers most committed to the employment equity process. According to the AJI, without real consequences for managers and Deputy Ministers, "voluntary [employment equity] initiatives have little impact mainly due to a "lack of public accountability" and an insufficient profile in departmental affairs.

Despite the fact that one in four new entrants to the Manitoba labour force is estimated to be Aboriginal, the implementation of employment equity policies continue to be based on the motives of good conscience/corporate citizen approaches. Some employers, especially those that are subject to federal employment equity laws, have been forced into action through non-compliance via human rights legal action. In either case, a policy constructed on such a weak foundation is essentially peripheral and secondary to virtually all other objectives, and therefore, one that is easily compromised

Notwithstanding the growing pool of qualified Aboriginal candidates, it is widely believed that without employment equity, employers by and large, will not hire Aboriginal people at a sufficient rate. In fact many believe that without past employment equity programs, Aboriginal employment levels in government would be considerably lower then even today's low levels. Their argument is based on the following factors:

- Employers have tendencies to recruit and promote individuals that they perceive best resemble the social, economic, and cultural characteristics of themselves;
- Employers, and many of their employees, generally exhibit negative stereotypes towards minority groups;
- Employers generally have a tendency to recruit within informal networks that minority groups generally do not have access to;
- Workplaces are generally built on the dominant cultures values and principles (corporate culture –systemically non-inclusive environments) that produce barriers for people of minority cultures.

According to the Manitoba Civil Service Commission, a strong business case can be established for employment equity within the Manitoba government civil service.⁴

- Employment equity is an investment in Manitoba's future labour force since one of every four persons entering the labour force is Aboriginal;
- Employment equity enhances the capacity for employers to be innovative and effective in customizing products and services to diverse clients;
- Aboriginal employment improvements will lead to a reduction in dependence on government infrastructure such as social assistance, judicial costs, etc.

A recent report indicates that there is little motivation for employers to act not because of a failure to accept employment equity but perhaps of an unwillingness to accept its perceived financial burden. However, contrary to these perceptions, employment equity can be a practical and cost effective initiative for organizations.

One of the strongest advocates of the need for employment equity legislation in Manitoba was the AJI Commission. In their 1991 report, they stated, "the continuing underrepresentation of Aboriginal people at all levels of the public service demands that all components of the government and, in particular, the justice system, formally adopt legally enforceable, target driven, equity employment programs." The AJI went as far as to recommend the enactment of employment equity legislation including the establishment of a formal Employment Equity Commission that would report directly to the Manitoba Legislature.

Despite some strong arguments for its inclusion, employment equity has encountered a great deal of resistance. Vocal critics refer to it as enforced "hiring quotas" and "reverse discrimination" that compromises the issue of merit in hiring decisions. In Canada, this debate was recently heightened in the Province of Ontario with the former NDP government enacting employment equity legislation in 1994 and its complete repeal in 1995 under the newly elected Progressive Conservative regime.

⁴ Putting Equity to Work, Manitoba Civil Service Commission, 1997; Employment Equity Business Case

What are realistic optimal employment targets?

While achieving employment equity targets that accord with current and forecast population demographics may meet general employment equity goals, a higher standard can be justified in certain cases. Since human resource development issues represent a critical factor in pre-determining an organization's overall level of performance, higher target levels for underrepresented groups can be considered strategically advantageous if such individuals can better assist an organization in discharging its mandate.

According to a recent report, employment equity can assist organizations in better serving their client/customers by assessing and responding to their particular needs.⁵ Presumably, organizations will be positioned to provide enhanced client services if its workforce better understands the particular needs and issues of its clients. According to the AJI, appropriate Aboriginal employment levels "should depend upon where the services are to be delivered and the extent of the Aboriginal population being served."

The Winnipeg Regional Health Authority (WRHA) has recently incorporated a client-centred approach within its newly established Aboriginal Human Resources Initiative (AHRI). The AHRI identifies Aboriginal recruitment as a significant means towards better addressing overall Aboriginal health care needs. Their rationale is based on a belief that Aboriginal patients generally feel more comfortable dealing with Aboriginal employees together with the recognition that Aboriginal employees, with all other things being equal, will better understand the individual needs of Aboriginal patients.⁶

Indian and Northern Affairs Canada (INAC), given its significant Aboriginal service focus, has developed an internal policy to recruit Aboriginal individuals at a rate of 50% of all new positions/vacancies within the department.

In terms of the Department, assuming the existence of a strong correlation between the quality of client services and the overall rates of repeat offenders, there exists an equal if not stronger business case.

According to the AJI, many Aboriginal accused do not adequately understand the law or the purposes of various procedures making them unable to follow court proceedings. This can and does lead to their making uninformed and inappropriate decisions at very crucial times in the process.⁷ As a result of language issues and other cultural disparities, optimal Aboriginal employment levels will lead to "greater understanding of the

⁵ Aboriginal Peoples & Employment Equity: The Manitoba Context. Joanne St. Louis, 2000

⁶ There are approximately 140 known Aboriginal employees out of approximately 6,000 total employees at the Health Sciences Centre (approximately 2.3%). It is estimated that on any given day at the HSC Children's Hospital, approximately 50 to 60% of the patients are Aboriginal.

⁷ One of the problems is that there is almost no Aboriginal people in the system to which they can turn for assistance or advice. Other than some police officers or band constables, there are few, if any, Aboriginal people employed by the legal system resident in Aboriginal communities. Even in towns and cities, there are few Aboriginal people within the system with whom the Aboriginal person can enter into a meaningful discussion about his or her charge and from whom he or she can receive advice and information. [AJI]

problems faced by Aboriginal accused, victims, witnesses and their families, and higher levels of assistance and advice."

According to the AJI, current levels of Aboriginal employment representation within the Manitoba justice system "represents a clear systemic bias against Aboriginal people". Moreover, this systemic "exclusion of Aboriginal people from decision-making positions within the justice system virtually guarantees that none of the discretionary decisions made by system personnel will be culturally appropriate to Aboriginal people".

A significant cause of Aboriginal over-representation within the Manitoba justice system has been attributed to the "inherent biases of those with decision-making or discretionary authority in the justice system" including the unconscious attitudes and perceptions [that] are applied when making decisions." In essence, "while Aboriginal people are the objects of such discretion within the justice system, they do not benefit from discretionary decision making, and that even the well-intentioned exercise of discretion can lead to inappropriate results because of cultural or value differences."

Therefore, higher levels of Aboriginal employment representation within the Department should result in the following expected outcomes:

- Reduction of repeat offenders over time through enhanced client services;
- Improved departmental policies over time as more Aboriginal people are recruited and promoted at the various levels;
- Greater overall understanding and acceptance of justice system by Aboriginal people over time and corresponding decreases in the rate of first-time and repeat offenders;
- Increases in the number of positive Aboriginal role models over time and corresponding decreases in the rate of first-time and repeat offenders;
- Less system dependency as more Aboriginal people attain employment.⁹

However, while there is general consensus on the need to employ more Aboriginal people within the justice system there is "no agreement as to how this is to be accomplished, nor has much attention been given to the breadth of representation that is required." In response, the AJI recommended that the Department establish minimum targets that are no less than the percentage of Aboriginal people in Manitoba in addition to optimum targets equal to the percentage of Aboriginal people served.

⁸ At the inquiry, Winnipeg lawyer Greg Rodin stated: "The real source of this discrimination is the well-meaning individual who does not consider himself a bigot but who, without realizing it, adheres to stereotypical views concerning natives. When these individuals hold positions of authority in our institutions, the result is institutional discrimination against native people and perpetuation of injustice and lack of equal opportunity." [AJI]

⁹ Employment leads to an improved socio-economic position and a reduced likelihood to enter system. According to the AJI, an individual's employment status influences the sentencing process (sentence length including possible bail provisions) and the decision making process affecting parole. [AJI]

As a result, recruitment and selection initiatives require a re-orientation of "credentials" and qualifications, all reflected within a framework of merit within a focused client-centred service approach. Based on this rationale, Anokiiwin Employment Solutions recommends that the Department undertake a functional, process-oriented approach towards Aboriginal employment development.

While Aboriginal people can be expected to make up the majority of new positions under a focused client-centred approach, some or many of these new positions can be filled by non-Aboriginal people providing that they have the necessary skills and experience in working with Aboriginal people and/or communities. ¹⁰ In this regard, the Department can effectively position itself toward achieving improved performance levels without having to subject itself to the perception of reverse discrimination.

In keeping with general employment equity principles, the Department and other departments and/or agencies within the Manitoba government civil service should set clear minimum targets for general positions (other than client-centred occupations such as accountants) based on the percentage Aboriginal people in the provincial population.

Optimal targets within the Department and other relevant provincial departments and/or agencies with a relatively high Aboriginal clientele, while not necessarily requiring a predetermined level, should be based on a long-term functional process-oriented approach determined by the percentage of Aboriginal clients served. Such positions include correctional officers, juvenile counselors, legal aid attorneys, court communicators (Aboriginal language interpretation), etc.

An effective Aboriginal employment strategy must be flexible capable of adapting over time as the clients' needs and issues change. For instance, setting long-term targets today to coincide with the current percentage of Aboriginal clientele may not be deemed a realistic goal since the composition of the clientele will likely change by the time that the results can fully mature. In addition, the strategy must be measured using a practical mix of qualitative and process-oriented benchmarks to support quantitative criteria in order to assess the quantitative results within their appropriate context (i.e. assess the required mechanisms that will eventually enable the results).

-

¹⁰ In certain areas, depending on the particular position, a higher emphasis should also be given to Aboriginal language proficiency in much the same manner and rationale as the French language fluency requirement in all federal government positions.

PART B: ISSUES AND STRATEGIES

A necessary component of an Aboriginal employment strategy requires an employer to establish an effective organizational commitment to the process. Recent research indicates that employment equity initiatives are likely to fail when organizations do not demonstrate the necessary commitment towards its implementation.

According to a recent report, employment equity initiatives are often administratively isolated creating additional costs and limiting the dissemination of knowledge and expertise. Separate organizational units can also be seen as additional administrative burdens rather than benefits for overworked managers. Discrimination as a cost needs to be better quantified to rebut the assumption that it is not cost effective. Employment equity has enhanced the capacity of organizations to be competitive yet this is underemphasized. The extent to which employment equity is essential to the core corporate values is the measure of how managers integrate it."

According to a recent report by the Conference Board of Canada, a successful Aboriginal employment strategy requires a strong well-integrated organizational commitment along with a flexible and creative approach and a general willingness to establish relationships with Aboriginal communities. ¹² Successful examples include:

- SaskTel is active in recruiting Aboriginal individuals due to a shortage of skilled labour within competitive industry, the high proportion of Aboriginal people in the provinces labour force, and the realization that Aboriginal people are becoming an important market in the province.
- CIBC bases its rationale on the recognition that employees should reflect the diversity of the communities where it operates and the fact that Aboriginal people are an increasingly important part of the its customer base.
- Cameco Corporation, a uranium mining operation that explores resources in the proximity of Aboriginal communities, has integrated Aboriginal employment as a corporate strategic objective to minimize the risk of lost investment and exploration opportunities. It has found that it requires commitment throughout the organization to deal with internal and external barriers. In order to ensure the required commitment, Aboriginal employment targets are communicated to all managers with managers being held accountable for achieving targets (annual performance evaluation).
- The North West Company recognizes that it makes sense for an organization that does business with Aboriginal people to have more Aboriginal people involved in managerial capacities. Its position is that the composition of the staff and management should reflect the composition of the workforce, which in turn, should reflect the composition of the customer base (about 80% of customers are Aboriginal).

¹¹ St. Louis

¹² Employment Prospects for Aboriginal People, Conference Board of Canada, 1998.

According to the Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives, in their analysis of non-traditional employment within the construction industry, the most significant factor in establishing an effective employment equity program was a strong corporate commitment since "neither the contractors or the trade unions welcomed equity provisions in the project agreement" process. ¹³ The equity provisions were the result of a "top-down decision that was codified both in the collective agreement and the structure of the project's management".

Critical Steps

An effective strategy requires the establishment of a fully integrated organizational commitment in order to increase Aboriginal employment representation at all levels and occupational classifications in all client-centred positions. For it to be effective, the strategy will need to be developed at the highest levels of the organization and be integrated both laterally and horizontally throughout all management levels. Such an approach will necessitate a fundamental re-examination and re-orientation of how employment equity is perceived –demanding an emphasis shift from "push" factors associated with inflexible quota paradigms and approaches to "pull" factors' based on strategic organizational goals/objectives.

With respect to the broader context of employment issues within the provincial civil service, depending on the nature of the particular department and/or agency, the level of strategic "pull" initiative will be expected to vary. For instance, given the Department's relatively higher proportion of Aboriginal clients, the level of strategic "pull" is seen to be quite significant. In contrast, the "pull" circumstances of the Department of Consumer and Corporate Affairs are proportionately lesser given its relatively lesser Aboriginal service context. In these cases, if influenced by strong and enforceable employment equity legislation and/or policies, such organizations will commit to achieve minimum outcome levels.

For the Department, including other organizations that have a high percentage of Aboriginal clientele, an effective Aboriginal employment strategy should establish the issue of Aboriginal employment representation as a strategic, formal, and priority organizational objective towards reducing the number of clients within its system. In this manner, an Aboriginal employment initiative should effectively translate into a sound organizational management practice. ¹⁵ In essence, such a strong and fully integrated

¹³ Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives, <u>The Road to Equity – Training Women and First Nations on the Vancouver Island Highway</u> (August 2000). Marjorie Griffin Cohen and Kate Braid.

¹⁴ Native and Northern Affairs (now known as Aboriginal Affairs) is deemed the highest.

¹⁵ "Employment equity communicator's and handbooks should clearly emphasize the business case for inclusion. Every effort should be made to acknowledge diversity within Aboriginal communities as well as the reality that they may be part of other equality-seeking communities by gender, sexual identity, language or different abilities. Without this awareness the individual Aboriginal employee may experience a

organizational commitment should act as an essential backdrop to effectively position the department and/or agency toward achieving meaningful and successful outcomes with respect to all of its specific and related employment initiatives.

Within the Department, a re-aligned approach can take its form within the existing mission statement with particular reference to principle #6: "We intend to provide services that are responsive and relevant to the varied circumstances and needs of those we serve and for whom we have responsibility." ¹⁶

Similar to other strategic objectives, executives, managers, and deputy ministers must be held to account for the program's overall success through a regular and formal performance reviews and appraisals. According to the AJI, increasing the numbers of Aboriginal people within the justice system requires "strong and assertive action and, in some cases, [requires] the direct intervention of an enforcement agency".

In order to determine optimal employment levels, an organization will need to answer the following three questions:

- How has the institution underachieved employment representation?
- Why has the institution underachieved?
- What have been the resulting costs?

For those organizations that are prepared to address these questions, but remain uncertain as to the resulting economic costs for its underachievement, it may be necessary for the organization to undertake a detailed cost-benefit analysis that will report on the net economic value of recruiting Aboriginal people(s) into its workplace. Using economic variables such as an average cost of recruiting a single individual into the department, an estimated retention rate, an average cost of a client within the system, etc., an organization, if necessary, will have empirical data and a "business case" to invest in effective Aboriginal employment strategies. In all cases, organizations should develop a very concrete business model in analyzing and detailing their investment approach.

heightened vulnerability to stereotyping or be denied the full accommodation to which they are entitled under human rights legislation." [St. Louis]

1.6

¹⁶ "The mission of the department is to administer a system of justice that promotes a safe, just, and peaceful society based on democratic principles, the law, and respect for rights and freedoms. Our aim is to administer an open and accessible system of justice that treats all individuals fairly." 1999 Annual Report.

Entry-Level Recruitment Strategies

To effectively recruit Aboriginal people into entry-level positions, organizations require a focused and committed Aboriginal recruitment strategy that is capable of reaching a critical mass of potential Aboriginal candidates. In general, it is widely believed that information on employment opportunities with Manitoba's largest employer does not currently reach sufficient numbers of Aboriginal people within the province.

An effective strategy will have both short and long-term goals. Short-term goals (measured within a five-year period) should target potential Aboriginal candidates that are considered job ready or near job ready. A long-term career awareness/promotion strategy (measured over an indeterminate number of years) should be targeted to Aboriginal youth at the primary and secondary school levels.

A successful Aboriginal recruitment strategy should be developed and implemented based on the following three principles:

- Ensuring sufficient Aboriginal input in the design and implementation stages;
- Developing strategic alliances with external Aboriginal organizations in both the design and implementation stages;
- Recognizing and addressing specific Aboriginal cultural issues at all stages within the recruitment process.

As a direct result of the unique cultural identity of Aboriginal peoples, including the existence of distinct economic, political, social, and cultural institutions, traditional recruitment methods are seen as being incapable of reaching a critical mass of potential Aboriginal candidates. Much of the problem stems from a set of unrecognized assumptions made by employers that are largely inconsistent and out of touch with the realities faced by Aboriginal people and communities. Such inconsistencies, however subtle they may appear, operate to systematically limit the intended and desired outcomes. Examples of unrecognized assumptions include:

- The choice of words used within advertising communication materials;
- The choice of venues for holding information and promotional events;
- The choice of advertising media, etc.

In order for employers to reach the required critical mass, traditional recruitment methods must be abandoned and replaced with methods that are sensitive to both Aboriginal cultural and institutional realities. Human resource personnel must, essentially, "get out of the box" and visit the place where Aboriginal people live, politically, culturally, economically, geographically, and socially.

Fortunately, government human resource personnel have begun to recognize the widespread disparity between their traditional recruitment methods and the specific needs

of Aboriginal people. As a result some employers are now attempting to address these shortcomings by incorporating improved approaches that are considered to be more consistent with the current realities of Aboriginal peoples and communities.

Unfortunately, depending on the level of organizational commitment of the department and/or agency, overall progress is considered marginal at best. Without a complete reorientation of the recruitment process, government employers will continue to fall short of the necessary goal of reaching the required critical mass of potential Aboriginal candidates, both now and into the future.

Critical Steps

A critical first step for the Department is to strengthen its internal Aboriginal human resource recruitment, retention, and promotion capacity. A primary measure will be to establish a permanent departmental Aboriginal Recruitment, Retention, and Advancement Advisory Committee (ARRAAC) capable of providing direction on all relevant programs, policies, and practices affecting Aboriginal employment issues. Membership should include representatives from the Civil Service Commission's Aboriginal Advisory Committee, Pitama, as well as internal and external groups.

A secondary but equally important measure is to employ qualified on-site departmental Aboriginal Human Resource Officers (AHROs) on a regular full-time basis. Such positions should play a key role in establishing vital linkages between Aboriginal employees, potential Aboriginal candidates, external Aboriginal organizations, and the departmental human resource office.

The degree and extent to which the department and/or agency commits to an Aboriginal employment strategy will in large part determine the overall effectiveness of these measures. This is based on the rationale that one person alone, especially a new employee from a designated group, can be in effect powerless without the committed support of the organization's senior management hierarchy.

In terms of other departments and/or agencies within the provincial civil service, depending on its relative size and its percentage of Aboriginal clientele, it may be beneficial for two or more departments and/or agencies to align themselves together by hiring one AHRO within a cost-shared and work-shared manner. Larger departments, especially those that have a significant Aboriginal clientele will be best positioned and best served if they employ more than one AHRO in-house.

Essentially, the Department's human resource office should strive for optimal Aboriginal employment representation levels over the long-term.

In most cases, the financial cost for employing an single AHRO can be accommodated within existing departmental budgets over the medium to long-term due to the natural retirement and replacement process, a process expected to be heightened over the next

five years. For departments and/or agencies that either do not have or do not forecast such vacancies within the immediate short-term (approximately three years) an immediate investment in an AHRO position may still be strategically beneficial even if it must incur additional costs over this short-term period.

In addition, an important initial step is to undertake a collaborative and comprehensive step-by-step formal review of the existing recruitment strategy within the Department. The purpose of the review is to identify and extract specific strengths and weaknesses – measured based on its capacity, through its experiences and subsequent results, to reach a critical mass of potential Aboriginal candidates.

Due to an assumed lack of in-house expertise on Aboriginal issues, the review process should include a sufficient independent analysis with the provision for recommendations. Within this process, sufficient effort must be undertaken to identify and eliminate barriers within the Aboriginal recruitment process. A final part of this step is to identify current vacancies, identify positions that are deemed difficult to recruit, and identify long-term employment opportunities forecast on future departmental needs.

Based on the results of this formal review, a critical next step is to reorient the department's recruitment systems and related processes in order to achieve the required capacity capable of reaching a critical mass of potential Aboriginal candidates. ARRAAC and the AHRO(s) will be expected to perform an essential role throughout this process.

An important first order of business will be to develop an effective and culturally relevant communications and marketing initiative with Aboriginal peoples, organizations, and communities. The goal of the initiative must be to promote short and long-term employment and career opportunities within the Department. The success of this initiative is likely to be determined on the level of its outreach capacity, and ultimately, its ability to forge strategic and formal alliances and effective relationships with vital Aboriginal groups, organizations, and communities. Efforts should be made to include internal and external Aboriginal focus groups to review and assess all communications and marketing materials (such as job advertisements).

Within this communications and marketing initiative, special emphasis must be placed within the areas of Corrections, Prosecutions, and Legal Aid since these areas represent a significant number of overall employment positions within the Department (approximately 50-60%). Currently, Corrections is expected to actively recruit qualified candidates over the next five years. Legal Aid Attorney positions should be favoured over Prosecutions since Aboriginal lawyers will generally be better positioned to represent rather than prosecute Aboriginal individuals (an issue believed to be a contributing factor in poor employment representation in the area of Prosecutions).

Notwithstanding some of the current difficulties in recruiting Aboriginal individuals, an effective communications and marketing initiative should improve Aboriginal employment representation within both these occupational areas over the short, medium, and long-term periods.

Recruitment Selection Measures

A vital component of any recruitment strategy lies in the selection process of identifying and hiring qualified candidates from an expected large pool of applicants.¹⁷ In all cases, human resource personnel base hiring decisions on an assessment of whether candidates have met the required level of qualification. Unfortunately, in many cases Aboriginal people are screened out of selection processes not because they are unqualified for the position but because the required qualifications, themselves, are not accurate and appropriate credential assessments for a particular position.¹⁸

Within the Department, there are a number of examples where stated occupational qualifications pose systemic barriers for potential Aboriginal candidates. One such example is in its relative under emphasis on "knowledge and experience in working with Aboriginal peoples and/or communities." The same can be said for Aboriginal language proficiency. Given the departments significant Aboriginal clientele factor, and the reality that clients are best served by the people that best understand their particular needs and issues, a candidates understanding of Aboriginal issues should be weighted higher than whether an individual has had a past criminal history or is bondable. In fact, some of the best employees that routinely work with troubled individuals are those individuals that can relate to the client though past episodes within their own experiences.

In the instances where an Aboriginal candidate may lack a minimally accepted education level (including non-Aboriginal candidates that have a sufficient understanding of Aboriginal needs and issues) it may be advantageous for the Department to hire with a provision for on-the-job training (in order to fill the identified education gap). In fact, this consideration is already extended to non-Aboriginal candidates that lack a sufficient level of Aboriginal awareness, with little or no guarantee that an Aboriginal awareness workshop will adequately fill this essential gap.

If Aboriginal people are employed in greater numbers at various levels within the department, including those non-Aboriginal people that have a sufficient understanding of Aboriginal needs and issues, the number of repeat offenders will decrease throughout the system over time (saving money in the process and justifying the investment). According to the AJI, "certain positions within the Department should be classified as *Aboriginal bilingual positions*.

¹⁷ According to a 1991 Manitoba Government Civil Service report entitled "Aboriginal Needs Assessment Survey Report", more than one third of respondents (Aboriginal employees within the civil service) indicated that selection and interview processes were obstacles because the process used was culturally foreign and discriminatory. The process was considered intimidating, insensitive, biased, and primarily focused on middle class values.

¹⁸ "One of the greatest barriers to employment opportunities lies in the formal qualifications which are used in hiring....The best alternative appears to be to ensure that all jobs are described in terms of the specific skills and knowledge required to do the job and to identify those related experiences which may be substituted for any formal requirement. Some jobs, we believe, could just as easily specify a proven ability to learn, as opposed to a specified level of educational attainment." [AJI]

¹⁹ Aboriginal accused are more likely to be denied bail, spend more time in pre-trial detention, spend less time with their lawyers, more likely to be charged with multiple offenses, an more than twice as likely to be incarcerated. [AJI]

Furthermore, since Aboriginal people are more directly affected by the justice system (most Aboriginal people will have family members or friends that are within the system), it is reasonable to assume that Aboriginal people have a larger propensity to care for the system due to their relatively larger stakeholder status. This greater propensity should translate into a more representative and responsive system over time as more Aboriginal people are recruited and promoted.²⁰

Finally, Aboriginal people employed within the Department will directly counteract the negative stereotypes and assorted incidents of racism. Internal racial biases within the system have been identified by the AJI as a significant factor that contributes and compounds Aboriginal peoples over representation within the judicial system.

Critical Steps

Therefore, based on the above rationale, one of the first orders of business within an Aboriginal employment strategy will be to examine and re-state all departmental occupational qualifications. A crucial measure is to place an added emphasis on criteria that measures a candidate's demonstrated skills and experience in working with Aboriginal peoples and/or communities. In addition, a clear policy must provide all human resources personnel with the directive to place greater emphasis on the weighting of this important qualification during the selection decision-making process. Finally, during the application and selection stage, all candidates should provide personal letters of intent as well as formal letters of recommendation from leaders within the Aboriginal community supporting their stated knowledge of Aboriginal needs and issues.

In all interview selection panels, irrespective of whether an Aboriginal candidate is being interviewed, the Department should further ensure sufficient Aboriginal representation. The rationale is based on the fact that the person seeking employment, in most cases, will be working with Aboriginal clientele. Aboriginal individuals at the interview session, and later at the assessment and decision-making process, can perform a valuable role in identifying a candidates demonstrated and expected competency level in understanding Aboriginal needs and issues. In terms of Aboriginal candidates at the interview session, adequate Aboriginal representation on the interview panel, and later at the assessment and decision-making process, can also assume a valuable role in bridging cultural differences that may not be recognized or be well understood by non-Aboriginal human resources personnel.

²⁰ "Because of their almost complete absence other than as accused, the system is now considered to be a foreign and uncaring one by Aboriginal people. This can be accomplished, we believe, only if the numbers of Aboriginal people within the justice system at all levels are increased." [AJI]

Retention Strategies

In recent years, there has been an increasing recognition that recruitment strategies, while necessary, are not sufficient in it themselves to achieve short, medium, and long-term improvements in Aboriginal employment representation. In essence, hiring a person in an entry-level position is one thing, keeping them is quite another. An important issue is retention. While retention statistics are said to be unavailable, many sources indicate that Aboriginal retention rates are at unacceptable levels in virtually every employment sector in Canada.

There are many reasons that are felt to cause and/or contribute to poor Aboriginal retention rates. According to sources, factors include:

- Culture clash between corporate values and Aboriginal values;
- Negative stereotypes and biases, including incidents of racism;
- Issues associated with workplace isolation and alienation;
- Perception that there may be a lack of career advancement prospects;
- Lack of employee support systems;
- Organizational down-sizing;²¹
- Underemployment and better job opportunities elsewhere.

Critical Steps

An important initial step is to develop an effective tracking system capable of monitoring Aboriginal retention rates including current occupational turnover rates. An important measure is to develop and administer formal exit surveys for all Aboriginal individuals that have left the workplace. Proactive measures would include regular and ongoing non-intrusive interviews with existing employees.

Assuming a genuine employer commitment to retaining Aboriginal employees, one of the greatest challenges towards improving Aboriginal retention rates within the Manitoba government civil service is to secure an effective working agreement with representative union organizations. According to some sources, unions represent one of the largest barriers in retaining and promoting designated employment equity groups.

An important step is to forge a formal union-management partnership initiative in similar scope and context to the Whitehorse Mining Initiative. The aim of this initiative will be to identify practical methods for breaking down barriers within the recruitment, retention, and promotion processes. In addition, government employers should also encourage and support representative union organizations to undertake a formal review of their own operational practices so that they can become more actively engaged and committed to

²¹ Aboriginal employees are at a general competitive disadvantage in job retention during periods of organizational downsizing. While a significant amount of employment gains have been made within the last ten years, Aboriginal employees are routinely at a relative disadvantage with respect to the issue of seniority (i.e. based on a "last in and first out" tendency).

achieving inclusive and diverse workplace environments. In this manner, government employers should provide adequate funding support to representative union organizations so that they can hire the required staff to undertake these initiatives. According to the Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives, in dealing with the Unions, they need to be "given" something in return for committing to employment equity in order to validate the process in the minds of their members".

A recommended initiative is to establish formal departmental Employment Equity Committees (EECs) in much the same manner as the existing provincial Workplace, Health and Safety (WHS) framework. The best case scenario would see a committee formed in each department and/or agency including one for the provincial civil service as a whole. By engaging in regular meetings, employment equity committees should play an instrumental role in affecting overall employment equity outcomes at the required front end. Utilizing a collaborative union-management management regime, formal minutes of each monthly meeting should be provided to the Deputy Minister and the President of the Manitoba Government Employees Union. Issues to examine include:

- <u>Inclusive workplace:</u> A critical issue is to undertake a concerted long-term effort into making workplaces safe and inclusive environments for all employees where all cultures are equally dignified and are represented. Given the scope and societal nature of government services, achieving this outcome is an inarguable imperative.²²
- <u>Conflict resolution:</u> Employers must develop and implement conflict resolution mechanisms in the workplace so that they can better deal with conflict situations as they arise and minimize conflicts before they arise;
- <u>Flexible working conditions:</u> Employers must also take active steps to implement flexible working conditions to address and respond to specific Aboriginal cultural issues and the retention barriers that they occasionally present under rigid work terms.
- <u>Diversity awareness:</u> Due to the prevalence of systemic biases, negative stereotypes and racism within non-Aboriginal dominated workplaces, departments and/or agencies must not only implement Aboriginal awareness and diversity training programs, they must also monitor, and evaluate their effectiveness.²³ Despite the provision of periodic workshops, formal mechanisms to assess whether such programs have had any measurable beneficial impact are non-existent.

²² "Employment equity is an opportunity to diversify organization values and approaches. This can have a very creative impact on policy making and client service. It presents a challenge to seemingly neutral values and challenges them to be even broader. Values such as growth, product quality, competence, profitability and productivity are all transformed when seen from a critical evaluative position. Business ethics and the economics of the market can be compatible. Employment equity can be translated into an economic value..." [St. Louis]

²³ Since racism exists throughout Manitoban and Canadian society, we have found that overt racism also exists in the administration of Manitoba's justice system....We find that a system that seeks to provide justice on the principle that all Canadians share common values and experiences cannot help but discriminate against Aboriginal people, who come to the system with cultural values and experiences that differ substantially from those of the dominant society. [AJI]

The mandate of the EEC should include education and internal communication of the potential contribution and organizational need to be served by the candidates to combat stigmatization. It should also include ongoing training and informal education in the workplace to ensure that all employees are aware of discriminatory barriers, can identify direct discrimination and can support the development of a welcoming environment. Finally, it should include ongoing training and support for management in the provision of employment equity and the development of appropriate management skills required for a diverse workforce.²⁴

An essential part of any Aboriginal employment retention strategy will be the attainment of a critical mass of Aboriginal people at all possible employment levels within the Department. The rationale is based on a recognized need to address workplace isolation and alienation issues that are occasionally experienced by Aboriginal entry-level employees. It is also required to establish a sufficient level of Aboriginal role models within the Department. Where and when possible, more than one Aboriginal person should be hired. An integrated strategy which would strive to lessen isolation and alienation by striving for a critical mass within a department or organization whenever possible.²⁵

A further step is to provide Aboriginal employees with culturally relevant and accessible employee support mechanisms such as mentorship and employee outreach services. Based on discussions with research sources, Aboriginal employees are less likely to access and benefit from existing programs and services such as the Employment Assistance Program (EAP) in comparison to non-Aboriginal employees. Furthermore, Aboriginal employees are less likely to receive the same level of support from their unions in comparison to non-Aboriginal people since representative union organizations, on balance, articulate the views of the majority of its members. As a result, Aboriginal employees have virtually no perceived accessible support venue when and if they require employee assistance.²⁸

²⁴ St. Louis

²⁵ St. Louis

²⁶ According to a summary report of the 1991 Manitoba Government Civil Service report entitled "Aboriginal Needs Assessment Survey Report", Aboriginal employees stated that support is a critical ingredient to improve retention outcomes. The survey concluded that networking support is necessary to overcome the isolation and alienation and other barriers experienced by Aboriginal employees. 87% of respondents indicated a preference for participating in a network process. Main benefits would include role modeling, developing contacts, exchanging information and learning how to cope as civil servants.

²⁷ According to sources, EAP does not currently employ an Aboriginal employment counselor on staff.

²⁸ An important employment equity principle is to "ensure that there are confidential options for support and the opportunity to address workplace discrimination issues independent of the unit in which the Aboriginal employee is located". St. Louis

Career Advancement Strategies

Within all workplaces, there exists an inseparable connection between positive employment retention outcomes and the perceived degree of career advancement prospects for employees.²⁹ This is based on an employees' intrinsic goal of fulfilling their own sense of potential within the workplace, a substantial contributing factor affecting employees' overall feeling of morale and subsequent level of productivity.

According to a summary report of the 1991 Manitoba Government Civil Service report entitled <u>Aboriginal Needs Assessment Survey Report</u>, "negative attitudes toward Aboriginal people create barriers to promotion and advancement. This, in turn creates a climate of suspicion and mistrust in the workplace resulting in alienation and isolation of Aboriginal staff. This survey shows a vicious cycle of results. The affects of discrimination and racism permeate the civil service, particularly in the attitudes of supervisors and managers and other employees. Consequently, Aboriginal people are excluded from employment, training, and career advancement opportunities. The outcome is the lack of support, exclusion and the cycle continues".

In response to the 1991 Aboriginal Needs Assessment Survey Report, as one of four main recommendations, the Civil Service Commission's Aboriginal Advisory Council identified a need to support and encourage a meaningful career development package for Aboriginal employees. In short, a successful Aboriginal employment retention and advancement strategy requires the provision of career development and advancement mechanisms and opportunities.

The current Aboriginal Management Development Program (AMDP) serves as a positive example of an active career development/advancement mechanism for Aboriginal employees. Administered as an interdepartmental program by the Manitoba Civil Service Commission, the two-year program is currently in the process of completing its second intake. Based on available accounts, the program is generally perceived to be a success.

Notwithstanding its early success, given Aboriginal people's widespread under-representation at middle to senior level management positions, the AMDP is considered as only a small step toward the promotion and advancement of Aboriginal employees into management level positions within the provincial civil service. Therefore, a successful Aboriginal employment strategy will work towards expanding career development and advancement mechanisms such as the AMDP in order to capitalize on the significant number of retiree-induced vacancies expected over the next five years.

²⁹ According to a 1991 Manitoba Government Civil Service report entitled "Aboriginal Needs Assessment Survey Report", 62% of respondents indicated that barriers to upward mobility presented major problems for Aboriginal employees. Approximately 54% identified the presence of favoritism and an "old boys network" (from which they are excluded), as a significant barrier. Furthermore, Aboriginal employees indicated that they experienced resistance when they request training with 39% saying that they lack support of management and another 39% saying they lack the opportunity to develop their skills.

³⁰ A total of ten Aboriginal civil service employees were selected in the initial intake (two from Justice) and a total of eight were selected for the ongoing second intake (three from Justice).

Large departments and/or agencies, especially those organizations that have a high percentage of Aboriginal clientele, can reap further benefits by having their own in-house version. The Department, for instance, could leverage such a program to advance up to forty Aboriginal employees into management level positions over a four-year period based on the implementation of a continuous rolling intake model. Under such a framework, the existing interdepartmental AMDP program should be maintained for smaller, less Aboriginal intensive departments and/or agencies. In addition, AMDP graduates should be included as mentors in all subsequent intakes.

However, prior to any expansion, a formal review process should be undertaken to determine any and all potential limiting factors that may exist in order to position the program as a best possible vehicle for realizing strong improvements in Aboriginal retention and career advancement outcomes. The review should include representation from unions, management, program participants, and the Civil Service Commission.

A separate initiative within an Aboriginal employment strategy is to provide Aboriginal employees with an accessible venue to receive valuable employee and career counseling services. As a significant step towards filling this gap, Anokiiwin Employment Solutions recommends that the Manitoba Civil Service Commission invest in the establishment of a formal mechanism with external support that is capable of providing effective career counseling and employee support services to Aboriginal employees.

Financed by all provincial departments and/or agencies, utilizing a sustainable formula based on each entity's proportion of total provincial civil service employees, the entity should undertake the following important initiatives:

- Providing career counseling (including formal assessments);
- Providing confidential employee counseling, mentoring, and other related employee support services through the provision of on-site outreach services;
- Mediating conflict between employees and employers within the workplace;
- Acting as a liaison between AHRO's within each department and/or agency.

A final measure is to administer a formal review process of existing on-the-job training programs offered by both the Department and the Manitoba Civil Service Commission in order to determine whether any systemic barriers exist that would negatively and unfairly impact Aboriginal employees access to these opportunities.

In general, retention and advancement issues have a compounding impact on the recruitment process, further impacting the overall level of retention and advancement rates. Therefore, both elements are crucial in an overall Aboriginal employment strategy.

actively promotes the program to its Aboriginal employees.

³¹ Based on discussions with human resource personnel, the Department would have preferred to have more of their Aboriginal personnel within both AMDP intakes. However, due to the limited capacity of the single interdepartmental program, additional candidates could not be accommodated. In total, Justice alone could accommodate ten Aboriginal employees at each of two intakes over the next four to five years.

³² Assuming that the program increases the number of participating departments (currently five) and more

Other Critical Measures

In order to support each employment measure, Anokiiwin Employment Solutions recommends that the additional measures be undertaken.

Initiating a formal Emerging Employment Opportunities Program (EEOP) with specific reference to potential employment opportunities concerning:

• Restorative justice initiatives. The current trend toward Aboriginal self-government with specific emphasis on restorative justice initiatives will offer Aboriginal people relevant community-based employment opportunities without many of the standard employment barriers normally associated with all other employers. "The trend towards Aboriginal peoples developing community corrections models, and working with CSC, is just beginning to gain momentum. Aboriginal communities have now started to come forth with initiatives to take over the care and custody of their peoples and offer services that are more consistent with community-based, culturally-specific methods of healing and balance."³³

Depending on the scope and nature of specific agreements with respective Aboriginal communities and/or representative organizations, certain employment positions within the Department can potentially be transferred to Aboriginal communities through a process of either dismantling, decentralization, and/or devolution.³⁴

- Advancements in information and communications technologies (ICTs). Recent advancements in information and communication technologies are making the administration of judicial services across distances more and more possible through videoconference-based consultations and other related innovations. Expected movements in this area should provide greater prospects for local employment.
- Expected vacancies due to eligible retirees. It is widely anticipated that a significant number of employment opportunities will be made available over the next five years within the provincial government civil service due to the expected number of eligible retirees. The development and timely implementation of an Aboriginal employment strategy within all provincial civil service departments and/or agencies can provide

³³ "Aboriginal communities are indicating that they can do a better job at healing Aboriginal offenders than the prison system will. What is most encouraging is that such programs are working. This is no surprise for Aboriginal communities who have been involved in taking over other institutions such as education, health, policing, etc." [Corrections Services Canada web site]

³⁴ Benefits will include: Creating a more attractive environment for recruiting Aboriginal lawyers by means of a shift from prosecuting Aboriginal people toward advising Aboriginal communities on the design and implementation of restorative justice models and initiatives; enhancing community-capacity building initiatives; effectively addressing the geographic barrier; provision of community and/or regional services; and the spin-off benefit of established federal/provincial government recruitment offices and resources in selected Aboriginal communities.

³⁵ According to the Manitoba Government Employees Union (MGEU), approximately 2,000 positions are expected to be made available affecting a full-range of clerical to senior management positions.

realistic and achievable prospects for qualified Aboriginal people to fill these soon-tobe vacant positions.

• <u>Decentralizing departmental services to local levels</u>. Notwithstanding the potential emergence of community-based restorative justice initiatives, government decentralization, in its self, may represent a practical step toward providing better client services locally.

Establishing a legislated Joint Party Committee (JPC) to examine the broad issues of Aboriginal employment issues within the Province. Manitoba needs leadership on this issue. As Manitoba's largest employer, the government can provide a model for other employers by demonstrating that equity in employment is both achievable and beneficial. Main issues should include:

- Examining the feasibility of enacting employment equity legislation within Manitoba;³⁶
- Examining practical support mechanisms to assist Manitoba employers in developing formal employment equity programs;
- Examining practical measures to promote Aboriginal awareness within Manitoba employers.

³⁶ The enactment of employment equity legislation with strong enforcement mechanisms capable of triggering the required level of organizational commitment within departments and/or agencies that lack strategic "pull" factors.

PART C: RECOMMENDATIONS

Anokiiwin Employment Solutions recommends a five-year Aboriginal employment development strategy based on a functional process-oriented approach complete with formal annual reviews. Specific recommendations are as follows:

1. Develop a clear government commitment to implement five-year strategy

- Initiate government commitment via a formal Cabinet policy directive with strong consideration given toward a formal legislative directive;
- Directive will need to ensure sufficient Ministerial accountability;
- Ministerial directive will need to ensure Deputy Minister accountability via regular and formal performance reviews (based on positive/negative incentives);
- Secure and allocate required financial resources to implement strategy;
- Identify and detail financial resources within Estimates framework.
- 2. Initiate a comprehensive step-by-step formal review of current employment systems within Department and Civil Service Commission
- Initiate a formal review on existing departmental recruitment, retention, and promotion systems including principles, policies, programs, practices, and protocols;
- Initiate a formal review on all CSC training principles, policies, and programs in order to identify any and all barriers and overall level of accessibility;
- Require each review to be a collaborative process (involving senior managers, unions, employees, Civil Service Commission, and other internal and external groups) with independent analysis and the provision of recommendations.

3. Increase Aboriginal human resource capacity within Department

- Establish permanent departmental Aboriginal Recruitment, Retention, and Advancement Advisory Committee (ARRAAC) -representation from Pitama, CSC Aboriginal Advisory Committee, and outside experts;
- Employ qualified Aboriginal Human Resource Officers (AHROs) immediately recruit an additional full-time and qualified AHRO -establish clear steps towards achieving optimal Aboriginal representation levels within the department's human resources section over the long-term.

- 4. Develop and implement formal initiatives to improve Aboriginal recruitment, retention, and advancement outcomes within Department
- Re-visit and, where necessary, restate all occupational qualifications (in collaboration with the Civil Service Commission and the departmental ARRAAC);
- Develop and implement culturally sensitive communications and marketing initiative with expanded outreach mechanisms in order to create enhanced linkages with vital representative Aboriginal organizations and/or communities –place special focus within the areas of Corrections, Prosecutions, and Legal Aid;
- Develop and implement effective employee tracking systems in order to monitor retention rates and general occupational turnover rates;
- Develop and implement ongoing evaluations of Aboriginal awareness programs;
- Develop and implement mechanisms for formal exit interviews and ongoing nonintrusive interviews with existing employees.
- 5. Review, improve and expand Aboriginal Management Development Program (AMDP) model within Department and government
- Review existing model and identify strengths, weaknesses, opportunities, and barriers Initiate a formal review of the program and strengthen any and all identified weaknesses (review process should include representation from unions, management, program participants, and the Civil Service Commission);
- Administer annual "rolling" intakes within Department (ten new participants/year) and include AMDP graduates as mentors within subsequent intakes;
- Administer and promote an improved interdepartmental AMDP model for all other departments and/or agencies within government.
- 6. Develop/implement formal mechanisms to ensure Aboriginal employee access to career advancement and employee support services
- Create an interdepartmental APCC entity with external participation;
- Cost recovery model based on sustainable approach;
- Funded by all departments with at least 50 employees based on proportion of total employees within provincial civil service (as of 1999/2000);
- Seed money with multi-year funding commitment.

- 7. Establish a formal union-management partnership to identify, address and eliminate employment barriers within Department and other areas within government
- Provision of capacity-building resources for unions;
- Assist unions in enhancing employment equity outcomes within their organizations;
- Provide funding support to unions to enable the required capacity to conduct a formal review of their operations and to identify/address any and all employment barriers.
- 8. Initiate a formal Emerging Employment Opportunities Program (EEOP) within Department
- Examine employment opportunities concerning restorative justice initiatives;
- Examine employment opportunities concerning projected retirees/replacement;
- Examine employment opportunities concerning information and communication technologies (ICTs);
- Examine employment opportunities concerning decentralization of departmental services to local and regional levels.
- 9. Establish a legislated Joint Party Committee (JPC) to examine broad matters affecting Aboriginal employment issues within Manitoba
- Examine feasibility of enacting employment equity legislation in Manitoba;
- Examine methods for increasing Aboriginal awareness among Manitoba employers;
- Examine practical support mechanisms to assist employers in achieving employment equity goals.
- 10. Establish a central joint union-management Employment Equity Committee (EEC) within government including a separate EEC within each provincial department
- Develop framework based on existing Workplace Health and Safety (WHS) model;
- Monthly meetings (minutes -reporting to Deputy Minister and Union President);
- Initiate "pilot" within Department.